
Ground collision between a Lockheed L-1011-385 and a Shorts SD3-60, San Juan, March 12, 1995

Micro-summary: This Lockheed L-1011-385 collided with another airplane during pushback.


Event Date: 1995-03-12 at 1305 AST


Investigative Body: National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), USA


Investigative Body's Web Site: <http://www.nts.gov/>

Cautions:

1. Accident reports can be and sometimes are revised. Be sure to consult the investigative agency for the latest version before basing anything significant on content (e.g., thesis, research, etc).
 2. Readers are advised that each report is a glimpse of events at specific points in time. While broad themes permeate the causal events leading up to crashes, and we can learn from those, the specific regulatory and technological environments can and do change. ***Your company's flight operations manual is the final authority as to the safe operation of your aircraft!***
 3. Reports may or may not represent reality. Many many non-scientific factors go into an investigation, including the magnitude of the event, the experience of the investigator, the political climate, relationship with the regulatory authority, technological and recovery capabilities, etc. It is recommended that the reader review all reports analytically. Even a "bad" report can be a very useful launching point for learning.
 4. Contact us before reproducing or redistributing a report from this anthology. Individual countries have very differing views on copyright! We can advise you on the steps to follow.
-

		NTSB ID: MIA95LA086A		Aircraft Registration Number: N724DA	
		Occurrence Date: 03/12/1995		Most Critical Injury: None	
		Occurrence Type: Accident		Investigated By: NTSB	
Location/Time					
Nearest City/Place SAN JUAN		State PR	Zip Code 00937	Local Time 1305	Time Zone AST
Airport Proximity: On Airport		Distance From Landing Facility:		Direction From Airport:	
Aircraft Information Summary					
Aircraft Manufacturer LOCKHEED		Model/Series L-1011-385		Type of Aircraft Airplane	
Sightseeing Flight: No			Air Medical Transport Flight: No		
Narrative					
<p>Brief narrative statement of facts, conditions and circumstances pertinent to the accident/incident:</p> <p>On March 12, 1995, about 1305 Atlantic standard time, a Lockheed L-1011, N724DA, flight number 189, experienced an on-ground collision during pushback at the Luis Munoz Marin International Airport, San Juan, Puerto Rico, with a Short SD3-60, N376MQ. The L-1011 is registered to Delta Airlines Inc., operating as a 14 CFR Part 121 scheduled domestic passenger flight. The Short SD3-60, is registered to Security Pacific esquire, operating as a 14 CFR Part 121 scheduled domestic passenger flight, by Executive Airlines Inc., doing business as American Eagle flight 5539. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and an IFR flight plan was filed for both airplanes. The Delta Airlines airplane sustained minor damage and the American Eagle airplane sustained substantial damage. The Delta Airlines airline transport pilot-in-command, airline transport pilot first officer, flight engineer, 8 flight attendants, and 302 passengers were not injured. The American Eagle airline transport pilot-in-command, commercial pilot first officer, 1 flight attendant and 23 passengers were not injured. The Delta Airlines flight was originating at San Juan, Puerto Rico, and the American Eagle flight originated from St. Thomas, U.S. Virgin Islands, about 31 minutes before the accident.</p> <p>The lead left wingman, for Delta Airlines flight 189 stated, they had just commenced pushback from gate 33 when he observed an American Eagle flight taxiing behind flight 189. He signaled the tug operator to stop the pushback. The American Eagle flight taxied past flight 189, stopped, started taxiing again, and stopped abruptly. The tug operator commenced pushback procedures without receiving instructions from the dispatching agent. The wingman signaled the tug operator to stop, however; the right wing tip of Delta flight 189 collided with the rudder of American Eagle flight 5539 before the pushback was stopped.</p> <p>Review of ATC transcripts from the time period of 1255:00 to 1308:00 revealed American eagle flight 539 requested and received permission to taxi from runway 10 to the ramp at 1300:12. At 1300:40, Delta Airlines flight 189 requested pushback clearance from ground control, and was approved at 1300:43. American Eagle flight 539 advised ground control "that delta aircraft just hit us on our tail pushing back." Delta flight 189 requested and received permission from ground control to return to the departure gate at 1303:37.</p> <p>The tug operator was interviewed by the FAA on March 12, 1995. The tug operator stated upon receiving initial clearance he began pushback operations, and stopped the pushback when he observed an American Eagle SD3-60 taxiing behind the aircraft from east to west. When he observed the SD3-60 on the west side of the L-1011, he resumed pushback operations, without receiving clearance from the dispatching agent.</p> <p>Delta Airlines SOP states, the dispatching ramp agent is responsible for directing the movement of aircraft. It also states the dispatching ramp agent is responsible for observing obstruction clearance and executing the appropriate ramp signals to the tug operator. It further states the tug operator is responsible for following the signals of the dispatching ramp agent.</p>					
FACTUAL REPORT - AVIATION					
					Page 1

 National Transportation Safety Board FACTUAL REPORT AVIATION		NTSB ID: MIA95LA086A			
		Occurrence Date: 03/12/1995			
		Occurrence Type: Accident			
Landing Facility/Approach Information					
Airport Name	Airport ID:	Airport Elevation	Runway Used	Runway Length	Runway Width
LUIS MUNOZ MARIN INTL.	SJU	10 Ft. MSL	0		
Runway Surface Type:					
Runway Surface Condition:					
Type Instrument Approach: NONE					
VFR Approach/Landing: None					
Aircraft Information					
Aircraft Manufacturer		Model/Series		Serial Number	
LOCKHEED		L-1011-385		L1011385115	
Airworthiness Certificate(s): Transport					
Landing Gear Type: Retractable - Tricycle					
Homebuilt Aircraft? No	Number of Seats: 305	Certified Max Gross Wt.	450000 LBS	Number of Engines: 3	
Engine Type:	Engine Manufacturer:	Model/Series:	Rated Power:		
Turbo Fan	Rolls-Royce	RB-211-22B	42000 LBS		
- Aircraft Inspection Information					
Type of Last Inspection	Date of Last Inspection	Time Since Last Inspection	Airframe Total Time		
Continuous Airworthiness	02/1995	217 Hours	58199 Hours		
- Emergency Locator Transmitter (ELT) Information					
ELT Installed?	ELT Operated?	ELT Aided in Locating Accident Site?			
Owner/Operator Information					
Registered Aircraft Owner		Street Address			
DELTA AIRLINES INC.		HARTSFIELD INTL. AIRPORT			
		City	State	Zip Code	
		ATLANTA	GA	30320	
Operator of Aircraft		Street Address			
Same as Reg'd Aircraft Owner		City	State	Zip Code	
Operator Does Business As:			Operator Designator Code: DALA		
- Type of U.S. Certificate(s) Held:					
Air Carrier Operating Certificate(s): Flag Carrier/Domestic					
Operating Certificate:			Operator Certificate:		
Regulation Flight Conducted Under: Part 121: Air Carrier					
Type of Flight Operation Conducted: Scheduled; Domestic; Passenger/Cargo					

 <p>National Transportation Safety Board FACTUAL REPORT AVIATION</p>	NTSB ID: MIA95LA086A
	Occurrence Date: 03/12/1995
	Occurrence Type: Accident

First Pilot Information

Name On File	City On File	State On File	Date of Birth On File	Age 54
-----------------	-----------------	------------------	--------------------------	-----------

Sex: M	Seat Occupied: Left	Principal Profession: Civilian Pilot	Certificate Number: On File
--------	---------------------	--------------------------------------	-----------------------------

Certificate(s): Airline Transport; Flight Engineer

Airplane Rating(s): Multi-engine Land

Rotorcraft/Glider/LTA: None

Instrument Rating(s): Airplane

Instructor Rating(s): None

Type Rating/Endorsement for Accident/Incident Aircraft? Yes	Current Biennial Flight Review?
---	---------------------------------

Medical Cert.: Class 1	Medical Cert. Status: Valid Medical--no waivers/lim.	Date of Last Medical Exam: 03/1995
------------------------	--	------------------------------------

- Flight Time Matrix	All A/C	This Make and Model	Airplane Single Engine	Airplane Multi-Engine	Night	Instrument		Rotorcraft	Glider	Lighter Than Air
						Actual	Simulated			
Total Time	10000	547								
Pilot In Command(PIC)		547								
Instructor										
Last 90 Days		130								
Last 30 Days										
Last 24 Hours	10	10								

Seatbelt Used? Yes	Shoulder Harness Used? Yes	Toxicology Performed? No	Second Pilot? Yes
--------------------	----------------------------	--------------------------	-------------------

Flight Plan/Itinerary

Type of Flight Plan Filed: IFR

Departure Point Same as Accident/Incident Location	State	Airport Identifier	Departure Time 0000	Time Zone
---	-------	--------------------	------------------------	-----------

Destination ATLANTA	State GA	Airport Identifier ATL	
------------------------	-------------	---------------------------	--


Type of Clearance:

Type of Airspace: Class E

Weather Information

Source of Briefing:

Method of Briefing:

 <p>National Transportation Safety Board FACTUAL REPORT AVIATION</p>	NTSB ID: MIA95LA086A
	Occurrence Date: 03/12/1995
	Occurrence Type: Accident

Weather Information					
WOF ID	Observation Time	Time Zone	WOF Elevation	WOF Distance From Accident Site	Direction From Accident Site
SJU	1253	AST	10 Ft. MSL	0 NM	0 Deg. Mag.
Sky/Lowest Cloud Condition: Scattered			4800 Ft. AGL	Condition of Light: Day	
Lowest Ceiling: None		0 Ft. AGL	Visibility: 13	SM	Altimeter: 30.00 "Hg
Temperature: 28 °C	Dew Point: 18 °C	Wind Direction: 30		Density Altitude: Ft.	
Wind Speed: 14	Gusts:	Weather Conditions at Accident Site: Visual Conditions			
Visibility (RVR): 0 Ft.	Visibility (RVV) 0	SM	Intensity of Precipitation: Unknown		
Restrictions to Visibility: None					
Type of Precipitation: None					

Accident Information		
Aircraft Damage: Minor	Aircraft Fire: Unknown	Aircraft Explosion: None

Classification: U.S. Registered/U.S. Soil					
- Injury Summary Matrix	Fatal	Serious	Minor	None	TOTAL
First Pilot				1	1
Second Pilot				1	1
Student Pilot					
Flight Instructor					
Check Pilot					
Flight Engineer				1	1
Cabin Attendants				8	8
Other Crew					
Passengers				302	302
- TOTAL ABOARD -				313	313
Other Ground	0	0	0		0
- GRAND TOTAL -	0	0	0	313	313

National Transportation Safety Board

FACTUAL REPORT

AVIATION



NTSB ID: MIA95LA086A

Occurrence Date: 03/12/1995

Occurrence Type: Accident

Administrative Information

Investigator-In-Charge (IIC)

CARROL A. SMITH

Additional Persons Participating in This Accident/Incident Investigation:

ROBERTO ECHEVARRIA
SAN JUAN FSDO
SAN JUAN, PR 00979